

1
2 LIBERTY NORTHWEST INSURANCE
3 COMPANY,
4

5 Plaintiff,
6

7 v.
8

9 CERTAIN UNDERWRITERS AT
10 LLOYD'S, OSPREY UNDERWRITING
11 AGENCY, LTD.,
12

13 Defendant.
14

15 Case No. 15-cv-02334-WHO
16

17 **ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO
18 REMAND**

19 Re: Dkt. No. 20
20

21 **INTRODUCTION**

22 Plaintiff Liberty Northwest Insurance Company brought claims for equitable contribution
23 and indemnity arising from a coverage dispute with defendants Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's
24 and Osprey Underwriting Agency Ltd. Defendants removed, claiming that Liberty's causes of
25 action should properly be considered to be an equitable subrogation claim for which there is
26 federal jurisdiction under 9 U.S.C. section 205. Defendants cite no authority that allows me to
27 disregard the causes of action actually pleaded in order to assert jurisdiction here. Pursuant to
28 Civil Local Rule 7-1(b), I find this matter appropriate for resolution without oral argument and I
VACATE the hearing set for August 26, 2015.

29 Liberty's motion to remand is GRANTED as defendants have not established federal
30 jurisdiction. Liberty's request for attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of defendants'
31 improper removal is DENIED because defendants had an objectively reasonable basis for seeking
32 removal.¹

33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
5510
5511
5512
5513
5514
5515
5516
5517
5518
5519
5520
5521
5522
5523
5524
5525
5526
5527
5528
5529
55210
55211
55212
55213
55214
55215
55216
55217
55218
55219
55220
55221
55222
55223
55224
55225
55226
55227
55228
55229
55230
55231
55232
55233
55234
55235
55236
55237
55238
55239
55240
55241
55242
55243
55244
55245
55246
55247
55248
55249
55250
55251
55252
55253
55254
55255
55256
55257
55258
55259
55260
55261
55262
55263
55264
55265
55266
55267
55268
55269
55270
55271
55272
55273
55274
55275
55276
55277
55278
55279
55280
55281
55282
55283
55284
55285
55286
55287
55288
55289
55290
55291
55292
55293
55294
55295
55296
55297
55298
55299
552100
552101
552102
552103
552104
552105
552106
552107
552108
552109
552110
552111
552112
552113
552114
552115
552116
552117
552118
552119
552120
552121
552122
552123
552124
552125
552126
552127
552128
552129
552130
552131
552132
552133
552134
552135
552136
552137
552138
552139
552140
552141
552142
552143
552144
552145
552146
552147
552148
552149
552150
552151
552152
552153
552154
552155
552156
552157
552158
552159
552160
552161
552162
552163
552164
552165
552166
552167
552168
552169
552170
552171
552172
552173
552174
552175
552176
552177
552178
552179
552180
552181
552182
552183
552184
552185
552186
552187
552188
552189
552190
552191
552192
552193
552194
552195
552196
552197
552198
552199
552200
552201
552202
552203
552204
552205
552206
552207
552208
552209
552210
552211
552212
552213
552214
552215
552216
552217
552218
552219
552220
552221
552222
552223
552224
552225
552226
552227
552228
552229
5522210
5522211
5522212
5522213
5522214
5522215
5522216
5522217
5522218
5522219
5522220
5522221
5522222
5522223
5522224
5522225
5522226
5522227
5522228
5522229
55222210
55222211
55222212
55222213
55222214
55222215
55222216
55222217
55222218
55222219
55222220
55222221
55222222
55222223
55222224
55222225
55222226
55222227
55222228
55222229
552222210
552222211
552222212
552222213
552222214
552222215
552222216
552222217
552222218
552222219
552222220
552222221
552222222
552222223
552222224
552222225
552222226
552222227
552222228
552222229
5522222210
5522222211
5522222212
5522222213
5522222214
5522222215
5522222216
5522222217
5522222218
5522222219
5522222220
5522222221
5522222222
5522222223
5522222224
5522222225
5522222226
5522222227
5522222228
5522222229
55222222210
55222222211
55222222212
55222222213
55222222214
55222222215
55222222216
55222222217
55222222218
55222222219
55222222220
55222222221
55222222222
55222222223
55222222224
55222222225
55222222226
55222222227
55222222228
55222222229
552222222210
552222222211
552222222212
552222222213
552222222214
552222222215
552222222216
552222222217
552222222218
552222222219
552222222220
552222222221
552222222222
552222222223
552222222224
552222222225
552222222226
552222222227
552222222228
552222222229
5522222222210
5522222222211
5522222222212
5522222222213
5522222222214
5522222222215
5522222222216
5522222222217
5522222222218
5522222222219
5522222222220
5522222222221
5522222222222
5522222222223
5522222222224
5522222222225
5522222222226
5522222222227
5522222222228
5522222222229
55222222222210
55222222222211
55222222222212
55222222222213
55222222222214
55222222222215
55222222222216
55222222222217
55222222222218
55222222222219
55222222222220
55222222222221
55222222222222
55222222222223
55222222222224
55222222222225
55222222222226
55222222222227
55222222222228
55222222222229
552222222222210
552222222222211
552222222222212
552222222222213
552222222222214
552222222222215
552222222222216
552222222222217
552222222222218
552222222222219
552222222222220
552222222222221
552222222222222
552222222222223
552222222222224
552222222222225
552222222222226
552222222222227
552222222222228
552222222222229
5522222222222210
5522222222222211
5522222222222212
5522222222222213
5522222222222214
5522222222222215
5522222222222216
5522222222222217
5522222222222218
5522222222222219
5522222222222220
5522222222222221
5522222222222222
5522222222222223
5522222222222224
5522222222222225
5522222222222226
5522222222222227
5522222222222228
5522222222222229
55222222222222210
55222222222222211
55222222222222212
55222222222222213
55222222222222214
55222222222222215
55222222222222216
55222222222222217
55222222222222218
55222222222222219
55222222222222220
55222222222222221
55222222222222222
55222222222222223
55222222222222224
55222222222222225
55222222222222226
55222222222222227
55222222222222228
55222222222222229
552222222222222210
552222222222222211
552222222222222212
552222222222222213
552222222222222214
552222222222222215
552222222222222216
552222222222222217
552222222222222218
552222222222222219
552222222222222220
552222222222222221
552222222222222222
552222222222222223
552222222222222224
552222222222222225
552222222222222226
552222222222222227
552222222222222228
552222222222222229
5522222222222222210
5522222222222222211
5522222222222222212
5522222222222222213
5522222222222222214
5522222222222222215
5522222222222222216
5522222222222222217
5522222222222222218
5522222222222222219
5522222222222222220
5522222222222222221
5522222222222222222
5522222222222222223
5522222222222222224
5522222222222222225
5522222222222222226
5522222222222222227
5522222222222222228
5522222222222222229
55222222222222222210
55222222222222222211
55222222222222222212
55222222222222222213
55222222222222222214
55222222222222222215
55222222222222222216
55222222222222222217
55222222222222222218
55222222222222222219
55222222222222222220
55222222222222222221
55222222222222222222
55222222222222222223
55222222222222222224
55222222222222222225
55222222222222222226
55222222222222222227
55222222222222222228
55222222222222222229
552222222222222222210
552222222222222222211
552222222222222222212
552222222222222222213
552222222222222222214
552222222222222222215
552222222222222222216
552222222222222222217
552222222222222222218
552222222222222222219
552222222222222222220
552222222222222222221
552222222222222222222
552222222222222222223
552222222222222222224
552222222222222222225
552222222222222222226
552222222222222222227
552222222222222222228
552222222222222222229
5522222222222222222210
5522222222222222222211
5522222222222222222212
5522222222222222222213
5522222222222222222214
5522222222222222222215
5522222222222222222216
5522222222222222222217
5522222222222222222218
5522222222222222222219
5522222222222222222220
5522222222222222222221
5522222222222222222222
5522222222222222222223
5522222222222222222224
5522222222222222222225
5522222222222222222226
5522222222222222222227
5522222222222222222228
5522222222222222222229
55222222222222222222210
55222222222222222222211
55222222222222222222212
55222222222222222222213
55222222222222222222214
55222222222222222222215
55222222222222222222216
55222222222222222222217
55222222222222222222218
55222222222222222222219
55222222222222222222220
55222222222222222222221
55222222222222222222222
55222222222222222222223
55222222222222222222224
55222222222222222222225
55222222222222222222226
55222222222222222222227
55222222222222222222228
55222222222222222222229
552222222222222222222210
552222222222222222222211
552222222222222222222212
552222222222222222222213
552222222222222222222214
552222222222222222222215
552222222222222222222216
552222222222222222222217
552222222222222222222218
552222222222222222222219
552222222222222222222220
552222222222222222222221
552222222222222222222222
552222222222222222222223
55

1

BACKGROUND

2 In October 2013, Ron Green brought personal injury claims against Ross Island Sand &
3 Gravel Co., to whom Liberty and defendants had each issued an insurance policy. Compl. ¶¶ 8-11
4 [Dkt. No. 1, Ex. A]. The present case arises from the \$1.2 million settlement of Green's claims
5 against Ross Island, of which Liberty paid \$926,500 and defendants paid \$223,500. Liberty
6 claims that it bore more than its fair share of the settlement payment and is thus equitably entitled
7 to contribution and/or indemnity from defendants as common obligors to Ross Island.
8 Consequently, on March 5, 2015, Liberty filed suit in San Francisco Superior Court, alleging
9 causes of action for equitable contribution and equitable indemnity.

10 Defendants removed the case to this district on May 26, 2015, invoking the court's federal
11 question and admiralty jurisdiction. *See* Dkt. No. 1. On June 24, 2015, defendants amended their
12 removal notice, adding diversity jurisdiction as a third basis for removal. Dkt. No. 17. Liberty
13 moved to remand on June 25, 2015. Dkt. No. 20.

14

LEGAL STANDARD

15 A defendant may remove a state action to federal court if the court has original subject
16 matter jurisdiction over the action. 28 U.S.C. § 1441. However, “[i]f at any time before final
17 judgment it appears that the district court lacks subject matter jurisdiction, the case shall be
18 remanded.” 28 U.S.C. § 1447(c). “The removal statute is strictly construed, and any doubt about
19 the right of removal requires resolution in favor of remand.” *Moore-Thomas v. Alaska Airlines, Inc.*,
20 553 F.3d 1241, 1244 (9th Cir. 2009). Therefore, “the defendant always has the burden of
21 establishing that removal is proper.” *Gaus v. Miles, Inc.*, 980 F.2d 564, 566 (9th Cir. 1992). Any
22 doubts as to removability should be resolved in favor of remand. *Id.*

23

DISCUSSION

24

I. THE COURT LACKS FEDERAL JURISDICTION OVER LIBERTY'S CLAIMS

25

Defendants removed this action on the basis of federal question under 9 U.S.C. section
26 205, admiralty jurisdiction, and diversity jurisdiction. Liberty disputes each of these grounds and
27 moves to remand the action to state court. In its opposition to the motion to remand, defendants
28 focus only on section 205 and state that “[a]lternative removal grounds reserved by [defendants]

1 therefore are moot, and the Court need not address them.” Dkt. No. 22 at 2.

2 **A. Defendants have not established federal question jurisdiction.**

3 9 U.S.C. section 205 permits removal of a state action that “relates to an arbitration
4 agreement or award falling under the Convention [on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign
5 Arbitral Awards (the “Convention”)]. Section 205 is triggered by “just about any suit in which a
6 defendant contends that an arbitration agreement clause falling under the Convention provides a
7 defense.” *Infuturia Global Ltd. v. Sequus Pharm., Inc.*, 631 F.3d 1133, 1138 (9th Cir. 2011).
8 Defendants argue that this case is subject to section 205 because an equitable subrogation claim is
9 subject to the Convention. *See* Dkt. No. 1 ¶¶ 9-18.

10 This argument fails here because Liberty has not pleaded a claim for equitable subrogation.
11 Liberty has alleged contribution and indemnity claims. Defendants do not argue that those claims
12 are subject to the Convention. Rather, they contend in their notice of removal that Liberty’s
13 contribution and indemnity claims “[are] actually a claim for equitable subrogation . . . based on
14 the insurance contract between [Ross Island] and Defendants.” Dkt. No. 1 ¶ 15. Defendants
15 likewise argue in their opposition to the motion to remand that “it is clear that there is no valid
16 claim for equitable contribution or indemnity because the two policies cover different risks.” Dkt.
17 No. 22 at 7.

18 Whatever the merits of defendants’ argument that Liberty does not have viable claims for
19 equitable contribution or indemnity, this Court is not the place to raise it. If Liberty’s claims are
20 deficient, defendants should have moved in state court to dismiss them for failure to state a claim.
21 They provide no authority for a federal court to dismiss existing state claims and recharacterize
22 them as ones which allow for removal. Since the operative complaint does not raise claims that
23 relate to an arbitration agreement or award falling under the Convention, section 205 is not
24 triggered. *Cf. SanDisk Corp. v. SK Hynix Inc.*, No. 14-04940-LHK, 2015 WL 1395910, at *11
25 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 26, 2015) (granting remand where arbitration clause had no bearing on the claims
26 raised); *Hawkins v. KPMG LLP*, 423 F. Supp. 2d 1038, 1048 (N.D. Cal. 2006) (“the arbitration
27 agreement relates to the claims in this lawsuit provided that there is a reasonable possibility that
28 defendants will be able to assert the arbitration clause against plaintiff”).

1 B. Defendants have not established admiralty jurisdiction.

2 28 U.S.C. section 1333(1) states that “[t]he district courts shall have original jurisdiction,
3 exclusive of the courts of the States, of . . . [a]ny civil case of admiralty or maritime jurisdiction,
4 saving to suitors in all cases all other remedies to which they are otherwise entitled.” The “saving
5 to suitors” clause “leaves state courts ‘competent’ to adjudicate maritime causes of action in
6 proceedings . . . where the defendant is a person, not a ship or some other instrument of
7 navigation.” *Ghotra by Ghotra v. Bandila Shipping, Inc.*, 113 F.3d 1050, 1054 (9th Cir. 1997).
8 Courts in this district have held that “admiralty and maritime claims are not removable to federal
9 court unless there exists some independent basis, such as diversity of the parties, for federal
10 jurisdiction.” *Cowan v. Baydelta Maritime*, 10-cv-05346-SBA, 2011 WL 1324463, at *6 (N.D.
11 Cal. Apr. 6, 2011); *see also Triton Container Int'l Ltd. v. Inst. of London Underwriters*, 98-cv-
12 0573-TEH, 1998 WL 750941, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 1, 1998).

13 As noted, while defendants invoked the Court’s admiralty jurisdiction in their notice of
14 removal, Dkt. No. 1 ¶ 19, they subsequently stated that said grounds for removal was moot and
15 that the Court need not address it. Dkt. No. 22 at 2. I treat defendants’ statement as a concession
16 that they cannot establish admiralty jurisdiction unless there exists some independent basis, such
17 as diversity of the parties, for federal jurisdiction. As explained in this Order, defendants have not
18 established any independent basis for federal jurisdiction.

19 C. Defendants have not established diversity of citizenship.

20 In their amended notice of removal, defendants added diversity of citizenship as a third
21 basis for federal jurisdiction, Dkt. No. 17 ¶¶ 19-23, though they subsequently stated that this
22 grounds for removal was moot. Even if not moot, defendants have failed to establish diversity of
23 citizenship because they have not disclosed the citizenship of the individuals that comprise the
24 “syndicates,” or “Names,” of Lloyd’s.

25 District courts have original jurisdiction over civil matters between citizens of different
26 states or between citizens or subjects of a foreign state. 28 U.S.C. 1332(a). Complete diversity is
27 required. *Exxon Mobil Corp. v. Allapattah Serv., Inc.*, 545 U.S. 546, 553 (2005) (“the presence in
28 the action of a single plaintiff from the same State as a single defendant deprives the district court

1 of original diversity jurisdiction over the entire action”). The party seeking to establish diversity
2 jurisdiction carries the burden of proof. *See Kokkonen v. Guardian Life Ins. Co. of Am.*, 511 U.S.
3 375, 377 (1994). Defendants have not carried their burden here.

4 Liberty is a company incorporated in Oregon, with its principal place of business in
5 Massachusetts. Compl. ¶ 2; Deogracias Decl. ¶ 10 [Dkt. No. 20-2]. Defendants have not
6 disclosed their residences. Instead, their removal papers simply state that none of their Names
7 reside in Oregon. Dkt. No. 17 ¶¶ 20-22. However, because Liberty is considered a citizen of both
8 Oregon and Massachusetts for diversity purposes, defendants must show that they reside in neither
9 state to establish diversity. *See* 28 U.S.C. § 1332(c).

10 “The unique nature and structure of Lloyd’s raises several issues in determining
11 jurisdiction” because it is uncertain which underwriter(s)’s citizenship should be considered for
12 diversity purposes. *Majestic Ins. Co. v. Allianz Int’l Ins. Co.*, 133 F. Supp. 2d 1218, 1221 (N.D.
13 Cal. 2001). In *Majestic*, after evaluating the differing views of other circuits regarding the
14 treatment of Lloyd’s for diversity purposes, the Court ruled that “each Name must be diverse from
15 Plaintiff to satisfy diversity jurisdiction requirements.” *Id.* at 1223; *accord E.R. Squibb & Sons v.*
16 *Accident & Casualty Ins. Co.*, 160 F.3d 925, 931 (2d Cir. 1998); *Indiana Gas Co. v. Home Ins.*
17 *Co.*, 141 F.3d 314, 319 (7th Cir. 1998). The Ninth Circuit has not addressed this issue.

18 I agree with the analysis in *Majestic*. Defendants’ conclusory statements about the
19 citizenship of their Names are not enough to establish complete diversity, particularly as
20 defendants have abandoned this argument.

21 **II. PAYMENT OF LIBERTY’S FEES AND COSTS IS UNWARRANTED**

22 Although I find that I have no jurisdiction, I will not award fees and costs pursuant to 28
23 U.S.C. § 1447(c). A court order of remand “may require payment of just costs and any actual
24 expenses, including attorney fees, incurred as a result of the removal.” 28 U.S.C. § 1447(c).
25 Generally speaking, such an order is proper where removal is “sought for the purpose of
26 prolonging litigation and imposing costs on the opposing party.” *Martin v. Franklin Capital*
27 *Corp.*, 546 U.S. 132, 140-41 (2005). “[T]he standard for awarding fees should turn on the
28 reasonableness of the removal.” *Id.*

1 Defendants' primary basis for removal under section 205, though ultimately unsuccessful,
2 was not sought for the purpose of prolonging litigation and imposing costs on Liberty.
3 Considering the still-evolving case law interpreting section 205, defendants proffered an
4 objectively reasonable basis for attempting to remove this matter to federal court. Accordingly,
5 awarding Liberty its attorneys' fees and costs is inappropriate under these circumstances.

6 **CONCLUSION**

7 Liberty's motion to remand is GRANTED. Dkt. No. 20. This matter is REMANDED to
8 San Francisco Superior Court.

9 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

10 Dated: August 24, 2015


11 WILLIAM H. ORRICK
12 United States District Judge